

Some broader points that stand out to me regarding the WA report on BIPs:

Doesn't address the compromising implementation shortfalls of the batterer program experimental evaluations laid out in several published papers.

Largely redoes the three main meta-analyses on batterer program evaluations that have been challenged by the prestigious and independent Cochrane Collaboration and a CDC report, as well as indirectly by CONSORT criteria and other implementation studies. Also ignores the discussions in several special issue academic journals regarding evidence-based practice and the likes of the GAO recommendations for evaluation.

Fails to sufficiently acknowledge the counter evidence from alternative statistical modeling endorsed in Public Health research, 2012 President of the American Society of Criminology, the General Accounting Office recommendations, and so on.

Recognizes a very narrow sense of "evidence-based practice" with very limited justification for its evidence as conclusive.

Uses exclusively a bio-medical conception of batterer programming without acknowledgment of the social intervention model that batterer programs arguably represent.

Does not consider the demonstrated impacts of program screening, compliance procedures, judicial oversight, and risk management. Nor does it weigh the implementation of coordinated community response that influences program outcome as well, and which has been shown in a number of studies to be insufficient.

Fails to adequately address alternative approaches to evaluation, incorporate practitioner feedback and interpretation, and acknowledge fully the limitations and qualifications of its meta-analytical approach. It consequently gives the impression of "conclusive" results rather than another point of view for discussion.

Suggests the possibility of alternative approaches that actually have very limited "evidence" to support them, as recent review articles show, and it fails to recognize the research support for cognitive behavioral approaches across several kinds of offenders.

Edward Gondolf: 2/14/2013